UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORKX	
CARMEN OTERO Mc CULLOCH,	
Plaintiff,	
-against-	07 CV 9780 (LAP) (RLE)
TOWN OF MILAN, TOWN OF MILAN TOWN BOAR JOHN V. TALMADGE, Town Supervisor, and ALFRED LO BRUTTON, PAULINE COMBE-CLARK, DIANE MAY, and ROSS WILLIAMS, Councilpersons, TOWN O MILAN PLANNING BOARD, LAUREN KINGMAN, Chairman, and Members JEFFREY ANAGOS, PETER GROSS, SHEILA MARGIOTTA, MARY ANN HOFFMAN, and PAULINE COMBE-CLARK, GARY E. BECK, Zoning Enforcement Officer, Town of Milan, and FRANK MARGIOTTA, BARBARA HUGHEY, and CHARLOTTE NORMAN,	<b>DF</b>
Defendants.	
X	

DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT

Rice & Amon Attorneys for Defendants Four Executive Boulevard Suite 100 Suffern, New York 10901 (845) 357-4000

Terry Rice

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PRELIMINARY STATEMENT
-----------------------

P	$\cap$	IN	$\mathbf{T}$	T
		117		

1
1
s 1
3
4
4
4
5
5
5
6
6
7
10
10

ii. No Policy or Practice	11
iii. Statistical Evidence	12
F. Conclusion	14
POINT V	
PLAINTIFFS LACK A PROPERTY INTEREST	14
A. Introduction	14
<b>B.</b> No Property Interest if Reviewing Agency Possesses Discretion	14
C. No Property Interest in Subdivision Approval or in Unconditional Subdivision Approval	15
POINT VI	
PLAINTIFF DOES NOT POSSESSES A SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS CLAIM	19
A. Equal Protection and Taking Claims Preclude Substantive Due Process Claim	19
B. The Complaint Fails to State a Substantive Due Process Claim	20
C. Because of the Existence of Available Judicial Review, a Substantive Due Process Claim is Not Stated	22
POINT VII	
THE COMPLAINT FAILS TO STATE A PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS CLAIM	23
POINT VIII	
NO TAKING CLAIM EXISTS AS A MATTER OF LAW	24
A. Plaintiff Not Deprived of All Use of Property	24
<b>B.</b> Conservation Easement – Not Unconstitutional Exaction	26

POINT IX	
CLAIMS AGAINST INDIVIUDAL DEFENDANTS BARRED BY KNORR-PENNINGTON DOCTRINE	31
POINT X	
INDIVIDUAL DEFENDANTS ENTITLED TO QUALIFIED IMMUNITY	32
POINT XI	
FAILURE TO ALLEGE FILING OF PROPER NOTICE OF CLAIM BARS CLAIM PURSUANT TO NEW YORK STATE CONSTITUTION, STATE LAW	33
POINT XII	
COMPLAINT FAILS TO STATE A CLAIM FOR TORTIOUS INTERFERENCE WITH CONTRACT/PROSPECTIVE ECONOMIC ADVANTAGE	34
CONCLUSION	35

# TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

# Federal Decisions

2922 Sherman Ave. Tenants' Ass'n v. District of Columbia, 444 F.3d 673 (C.A.D.C. 2006)	12
Affordable Housing Development Corp. v. City of Fresno, 433 F.3d 1182 (9th Cir. 2006)	31
Agins v. City of Tiburon, 447 U.S. 255 (1980)	28, 29
Albiero v. City of Kankakee, 122 F.3d 417 (7th Cir. 1997)	21
Albright v. Oliver, 510 U.S. 266 (1994)	19
Alpha III, Inc. v. City of San Diego, 187 Fed.Appx. 709 (9th Cir. 2006)	31
Andrus v. Allard, 444 U.S. 51 (1979)	25
Armendariz v. Penman, 75 F.3d 1311 (9th Cir. 1996)	19
Ayeni v. Mottola, 35 F.3d 680 (2d Cir. 1994), cert. denied, 514 U.S. 1062 (1995)	19
Bangerter v. Orem City Corp., 46 F.3d 1491 (10 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1995)	7
Barta v. Board of Regents, 79 F.3d 717 (8th Cir. 1996)	15 n.4
Bello v. Walker, 840 F.2d 1124 (1st Cir.), cert. denied, 488 U.S. 868 (1988)	23
Benjamin v. Town of Fenton, 892 F.Supp. 64 (N.D.N.Y. 1995)	21
Blain v. Township of Radnor, 2004 WL 1151727 (E.D.Pa. 2004), aff'd, 167 Fed.Appx. 330 (3d Cir. 2006)	29
Board of Regents v. Roth, 408 U.S. 564 (1972)	15 n.4
Boulware v. Nevada Department of Human Resources, 793 F.2d 800 (9 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1992)	31
Bower Associates v. Town of Pleasant Valley, 2 N.Y.3d 617, 781 N.Y.S.2d 240, 814 N.E.2d 410 (2004)	15-16
Brady v. Town of Colchester, 863 F.2d 205 (2d Cir. 1988)	23

Bryant v. City of New York, 404 F.3d 128 (2d Cir. 2005)	20
Bryant Woods Inn, Inc. v. Howard County, 911 F.Supp.2d 918 (D.My 1996), aff'd, 124 F.3d 597 (4 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1997)	10 n.2
Buckles v. King County, 191 F.3d 1127 (9th Cir. 1999)	20
Caidor v. M & T Bank, 2006 WL 839547 (N.D.N.Y. 2006)	20
California Motor Transp. Co. v. Trucking Unlimited, 404 U.S. 508 (1972)	31
Catanzaro v. Weiden, 188 F.3d 56 (2d Cir. 1999)	20
Carson Harbor Village, Ltd. v. City of Carson, 37 F.3d 468 (9th Cir. 1994)	1
Cedarwood v. Town of Schodack, 954 F.Supp. 513 (N.D.N.Y. 1997)	15
Chiplin Enterprises v. City of Lebanon, 712 F.2d 1524 (1st Cir. 1983)	21
City of Monterey v. Del Monte Dunes at Monterey, 526 U.S. 687 (1999)	26
Country View Estates @ Ridge LLC v. Town of Brookhaven, 452 F.Supp.2d 142 (E.D.N.Y. 2006)	2
County of Sacramento v. Lewis, 523 U.S. 833 (1998)	19, 20
County of Suffolk v. Long Island Lighting Co., 710 F.Supp. 1387 (E.D.N.Y. 1989), aff'd, 907 F.2d 1295 (2d Cir. 1990)	31
Creative Environment, Inc. v. Estabrook, 680 F.2d 822 (1st Cir.), cert. denied, 459 U.S. 989 (1982)	23
Crowley v. Courville, 76 F.3d 47 (2d Cir. 1996)	14, 15, 20
DeBlasio v. Zoning Board of Adjustment of the Town of West Armwell, 53 F.3d 593 (3d Cir.), cert .denied, 516 U.S. 937 (1995)	23
Deepwells Estates, Inc. v. Village of Head of the Harbor, 973 F.Supp. 338 (E.D.N.Y. 1997), appeal dismissed, 162 F.3d 1147 (2d Cir. 1998)	15-16
DLC Management Corp. v. Town of Hyde Park, 163 F.3d 124 (2d Cir. 1998)	15
Dolan v. City of Tigard, 512 U.S. 374 (1994)	26, 27, 28
Dougherty v. Town of New Hempstead Board of Zoning Appeals, 282 F.3d 83 (2d Cir. 2002)	2

Eastampton Center, L.L.C. v. Township of Eastampton, 155 F.Supp.2d 102 (D.N.J. 2001)	7
Edwards v. Media Borough Council, 430 F.Supp.2d 445 (E.D. Pa. 2006)	12
Eichenlaub v. Township of Indiana, 385 F.3d 285 (3d Cir. 2004)	22 n.6
Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co., 272 U.S. 365 (1926)	25
Fischer Sand & Aggregate Co. v. City of Lakeville, 874 F.2d 957 (D. Minn. 1994)	31
First English Evangelical Lutheran Church v. County of Los Angeles, 427 U.S. 304 (1987)	24
Frooks v. Town of Cortland, 997 F.Supp. 438 (S.D.N.Y. 1998), aff'd, 182 F.3d 899 (2d Cir. 1999)	3, 21
Gagliardi v. Village of Pawling, 18 F.3d 188 (2d Cir. 1994)	15, 23 n.7
Gamble v. City of Escondido, 104 F.3d 300 (9th Cir. 1997)	10
Garcia v. Spun Steak Co., 998 F.2d 1480, rehearing denied, 13 F.3d 296 (9th Cir. 1993)	11, 12
Goldbaltt v. Town of Hempstead, 369 U.S. 590 (1962)	24-25
Gottlieb v. Village of Irvington, 69 F.Supp.2d 553 (S.D.N.Y. 1999)	2 n.1, 22
Graham v. Connor, 490 U.S. 386 (1989)	19
Hadacheck v. Sebastian, 239 U.S. 394 (1915)	25
Hallmark Developers, Inc. v. Fulton County, 466 F.3d 1276 (11th Cir. 2006)	10, 13
Hamilton v. Svatik, 779 F.2d 383 (7th Cir.1985)	8
Hampton Bays Connections, Inc. v. Duffy, 127 F.Supp.2d 364 (E.D.N.Y. 2001)	24
Harlen Associates v. Village of Mineola, 273 F.3d 494, 501 (2d Cir 2001)	10 n.2, 14
Hellenic American Neighborhood Action Comm. v. City of New York, 101 F.3d 877 (2d Cir. 1996), cert. dismissed, 521 U.S. 1140 (1997)	22

171 F.3d 437 (7 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1999)	12
Hi Pockets, Inc. v. The Music Conservatory of White Plains, 192 F.Supp.2d 143 (S.D.N.Y. 2002)	22
Hoeck v. City of Portland, 57 F.3d 781 (9 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1995), cert. denied, 516 U.S. 1112 (1996)	21 n.5
Honess 52 Corp. v. Town of Fishkill, 1 F.Supp.2d 294 (S.D.N.Y. 1998)	17
Huntington Branch, N.A.A.C.P. v. Town of Huntington, 844 F.2d 926 (2d Cir. 1988), aff'd in part, 488 U.S. 15 (1988), rehearing denied, 488 U.S. 1023 (1989)	13
Jones v. McMahon, 2005 WL 928667 (N.D.N.Y. 2005), aff'd, in part, dismissed in part, 465 F.3d 46, 2006 WL 2828506 (2006)	20
Kaluczky v. City of White Plains, 57 F.3d 202 (2d Cir. 1995)	19
Keystone Bituminous Coal Ass'n v. DeBenedictis, 480 U.S. 470 (1987)	25
LeBlanc-Sternberg v. Fletcher, 67 F.3d 412 (2d Cir. 1995)	5, 7, 9
<i>Licari v. Ferruzzi</i> , 22 F.3d 344 (1 <sup>st</sup> Cir. 1994)	20
Lingle v. Chevron USA Inc., 544 U.S. 528 (2005)	26
Lorence v. Achtyl, 20 F.3d 529 (2d Cir. 1994)	21
Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council, 505 U.S. 1003 (1992)	24
McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Green, 411 U.S. 792 (1973)	7
Macone v. Town of Wakefield, 277 F.3d 1 (1st Cir. 2002)	13
Manistee Town Center v. City of Glendale, 227 F.3d 1090 (9th Cir. 2000)	31
Maple Properties, Inc. v. Township of Upper Providence, 151 Fed.Appx. 174 (3d Cir. 2005)	22 n.6
Marathon Outdoor, LLC v. Vesconti, 107 F.Supp.2d 355 (S.D.N.Y. 2000)	2
Marino v. Ameruso, 837 F.2d 45 (2d. Cir.1988)	24

Marriott Senior Living Services, Inc. v. Springfield Township, 78 F.Supp.2d 376 (E.D.Pa. 1999)	2
Martin v. N.Y. State Dep't of Mental Hygiene, 588 F.2d 371 (2d Cir. 1978)	8
Midnight Sessions, Ltd. v. City of Philadelphia, 945 F.2d 667 (3d Cir. 1991), cert. denied, 503 U.S. 984 (1992)	10 n.2, 23
Mikels Motors, Inc. v. Township of Stroud, 48 Fed.Appx. 844 (3d Cir. 2002)	10 n.2
Miracle Mile Associates v. City of Rochester, 617 F.2d 18 (2d Cir. 1980)	31
<i>Missouri v. National Organization for Woman</i> , 620 F.2d 1301 (8 <sup>th</sup> Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 449 U.S. 842 (1980)	31
MKA Realty Corp. v. Town of Wallkill, 82 Fed.Appx. 712 (2d Cir. 2003)	14
Mountain Side Mobile Estate Partnership v. Secretary of Housing and Urban Development, 56 F.3d 1243 (10 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1995)	11, 13
Murphy v. New Milford Zoning Commission, 402 F.3d 342 (2d Cir. 2005)	2
Natale v. Town of Ridgefield, 170 F.3d 258 (2d Cir. 1999)	15, 22, 32
Nollan v. California Coastal Commission, 483 U.S. 825 (1987)	26, 27, 28
Norton v. Village of Corrales, 103 F.3d 928 (10 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1996)	21
Orange Lake Associates v. Kirkpatrick, 21 F.3d 1214 (2d Cir. 1994)	16, 24
Palazzolo v. Rhode Island, 533 U.S. 606 (2001)	25
Palmieri v. Town of Babylon, 2006 WL 1155162 (E.D.N.Y. 2006)	7, 11
Penn Central Transportation Co. v. City of New York, 438 U.S. 104 (1978)	24, 25, 28, 29
<i>PFZ Properties v. Rodrigues</i> , 928 F.2d 28 (1 <sup>st</sup> Cir. 1991), <i>cert. dismissed</i> , 503 U.S. 257 (1992)	22
Regional Economic Community Action Program, Inc. v. City of Middletown, 294 F.3d 35, 49 (2d Cir.), cert. denied, 537 U.S. 813 (2002)	7, 9, 10, 11
Reinhart v. Lincoln County, 482 F.3d 1225 (10 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2007)	7, 10, 11, 12

Robinson v. Limerick Township, 2005 WL 627880 (E.D.Pa. 2005)	22 n.6
RRI Realty Corp. v. Village of Southampton, 870 F.2d 911 (2d Cir.), cert. denied, 493 U.S. 893 (1989)	15, 15 n.3
Sag Harbor Port Assocs. v. Village of Sag Harbor, 21 F.Supp.2d 179 (E.D.N.Y. 1998), aff'd, 182 F.3d 901 (2d Cir 1999)	3
Sanghvi v. City of Claremont, 328 F.3d 532 (9th Cir.), cert. denied, 540 U.S. 1075 (2003), rehearing denied, 540 U.S 1170 (2004)	31
Simms v. First Gibraltar Bank, 83 F.3d 1546 (5 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1996), cert. denied, 519 U.S. 1041 (1996)	10
Smith v. City of Albany, 2006 WL 839525 (N.D.N.Y. 2006), aff'd, 2007 WL 2973995 (2d Cir. 2007)	20
Smith v. United Federation of Teachers, 162 F.3d 1148 (2d Cir.), cert. denied, 525 U.S. 883 (1998)	8
Smith & Lee Associates, Inc. v. City of Taylor, 102 F.3d 781 (6th Cir. 1996)	7
Southend Neighborhood Imp. Ass'n v. St. Clair County, 743 F.2d 1207 (7 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 1984)	10
Southview Associates v. Bongartz, 980 F.2d 84 (2d Cir. 1992), cert. denied, 507 U.S. 987 (1993)	2, 21
Spradlin v. Borough of Danville, 2005 WL 3320788 (M.D.Pa. 2005), aff'd, 188 Fed.Appx. 149 (3d Dept. 2006)	22 n.6
Spaulding v. University of Washington, 740 F.2d 686 (9th Cir.), cert. denied, 469 U.S. 1036 (1984)	11
Sylvia Development Corp. v. Calvert County, 48 F.3d 810 (4th Cir. 1995)	20, 21
Tahoe-Sierra Preservation Council, Inc. v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency, 535 U.S. 302 (2002)	25
Tara Circle, Inc. v. Bifano, 1997 WL 399 683 (S.D.N.Y. 1997)	23-24
Triomphe Investors v. City of Northwood, 49 F.3d 198 (6 <sup>th</sup> Cir.), cert. denied, 516 U.S. 816 (1995)	21
T.S. Haulers v. Town of Riverhead, 190 F.Supp. 455 (E.D.N.Y. 2002)	24

Tsombanidis v. West Haven Fire Dept., 352 F.3d 565 (2d Cir. 2003)	7
Tsombanidis v. City of West Haven, 129 F.Supp.2d 136 (D.Conn. 2001	.) 2
Tufano v. One Toms Point Lane Corp., 64 F.Supp.2d 119 (E.D.N.Y. 1999), aff'd, 229 F.3d 1136 (2d Cir. 2000)	8, 9
Velez v. Levy, 401 F.3d 75 (2d Cir. 2005)	20
<i>Ventura Village, Inc. v. City of Minneapolis</i> , 318 F.Supp.2d 822 (D. Minn. 2004), <i>aff'd</i> , 419 F.3d 725 (8 <sup>th</sup> Cir. 2005)	11
Village of Arlington Heights v. Metropolitan Housing Development Corp., 429 U.S. 252 (1977)	7
Village Ponder v. Town of Darien, 56 F.3d 375 (2d Cir. 1995), cert. denied, 117 S.Ct. 50 (1996)	14-15
Westrum Land Development Corp. v. Whitpain Township, 2002 WL 32351106 (E.D.Pa. 2002)	29
Williamson County Regional Planning Commission v. Hamilton Bank, 473 U.S. 172 (1985)	1, 3
Woodfield Equities, LLC v. Village of Patchogue, 357 F.Supp.2d 622 (E.D.N.Y.), aff'd, 156 Fed.Appx. 389 (2d Cir. 2005)	2
Yale Auto Parts v. Johnson, 758 F.2d 54 (2d Cir. 1985)	22
Yusuf v. Vassar College, 35 F.3d 709 (2d Cir. 1994)	8
Zahra v. Town of Southold, 48 F.3d 674 (2d Cir. 1995)	14, 15, 21, 23 n.7, 32
Zeigler v. Town of Kent, 258 F.Supp.2d 49 (D.Conn. 2003)	18
Federal Statutes	
42 U.S.C. § 3604(a)	6
42 U.S.C. § 3613(a)(1)(A)	4, 6

# State Court Decisions

Alaxanian v. City of Troy, 69 A.D.2d 937, 415 N.Y.S.2d 293 (3d Dept. 1979)	34
American Preferred Prescriptions, Inc. v. Health Management, Inc., 252 A.D.2d 414, 417, 678 N.Y.S.2d 1, 4 (1st Dept 1998)	34
Bidnick v. Johnson, 253 A.D.2d 779, 677 N.Y.S.2d 614 (2d Dept. 1998)	34
Caprer v. Nussbaum, 36 A.D.3d 176, 825 N.Y.S.2d 55 (2d Dept. 2006)	35
De St. Aubin v. Flacke, 68 N.Y.2d 66, 505 N.Y.S.2d 859, 496 N.E.2d 879 (1986)	5
Fawn Builders v. Planning Bd. of Lewisboro, 223 A.D.2d 996, 636 N.Y.S.2d 873 (3d Dept. 1996)	16
Gazza v. New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, 89 N.Y.2d 603, 657 N.Y.S.2d 555, 679 N.E.2d 1035, cert. denied, 522 U.S. 813 (1997)	24
Greifenberger v. Pav, 225 A.D.2d 731, 640 N.Y.S.2d 197 (2d Dept. 1996), lv. dismissed in part, denied in part, 89 N.Y.2d 963, 655 N.Y.S.2d 883, 678 N.E.2d 495 (1997)	33
Guard-Life Corp. v. Parker Hardware Mfg. Corp., 50 N.Y.2d 183, 428 N.Y.S.2d 628, 406 N.E.2d 445 (1980)	35
Home Town Muffler Inc. v. Cole Muffler Inc., 202 A.D.2d 764, 608 N.Y.S.2d 735 (3d Dept. 1994)	35
Innovative Technology Group Corp. v. Planning Bd. of Town of Woodbury, 20 A.D.3d 531, 799 N.Y.S.2d 544 (2d Dept. 2005)	5
Klein v. City of Yonkers, 73 A.D.2d 931, 423 N.Y.S.2d 685 (2d Dept. 1980), aff'd, 53 N.Y.2d 1011, 442 N.Y.S.2d 477, 425 N.E.2d 865 (1981)	33
Korbel v. Zoning Board of Appeals of the Town of Horicon, 28 A.D.3d 888, 814 N.Y.S.2d 301 (3d Dept. 2006)	2
Lama Holding Co. v. Smith Barney Inc., 88 N.Y.2d 413, 646 N.Y.S.2d 76, 668 N.E.2d 1370 (1996)	34
Landing Estates v. Jones, 67 Misc.2d 354, 324 N.Y.S.2d 255 (Sup. Ct. Suffolk Co. 1971)	17

Long Island Pine Barrens Soc., Inc. v. Planning Board of the Town of Brookhaven, 78 N.Y.2d 608, 578 N.Y.S.2d 466, 585 N.E.2d 778 (1991)	5
Mackall v. White, 85 A.D.2d 696, 445 N.Y.S.2d 486 (2d Dept. 1981), lv. denied, 56 N.Y.2d 503, 435 N.E.2d 1100, 450 N.Y.S.2d 1025 (1982)	18
McGowan v. Cohalan, 41 N.Y.2d 434, 393 N.Y.S.2d 376, 361 N.E.2d 1025 (1978)	25
Miller v. Price, 267 A.D.2d 363, 700 N.Y.S.2d 209 (2d Dept. 1999)	2
M & M Partnership v. Sweenor, 210 A.D.2d 575, 619 N.Y.S.2d 802 (3d Dept. 1994)	16
Northern Westchester Professional Park Assocs. v. Town of Bedford, 60 N.Y.2d 492, 470 N.Y.S.2d 350, 458 N.E.2d 809 (1983)	25
Ozols v. Henley, 81 A.D.2d 670, 438 N.Y.S.2d 349 (2d Dept.), appeal dismissed, 54 N.Y.2d 1023, 446 N.Y.S.2d 263, 430 N.E.2d 1316 (1981)	17
Pearson Kent Corp. v. Bear, 28 N.Y.2d 396, 322 N.Y.S.2d 235, 271 N.E.2d 218 (1971)	17
Reed v. Planning Board of the Town of Chester, 120 A.D.2d 510, 501 N.Y.S.2d 710 (2d Dept. 1986)	17
Ross v. Town of Santa Clara, 266 A.D.2d 678, 698 N.Y.S.2d 90 (3d Dept. 1999)	29
Smith v. Town of Mendon, 4 N.Y.3d 1, 789 N.Y.S.2d 696, 822 N.E.2d 1214 (2004)	5, 27-28
<i>Snyder v. Sony Music Entertainment, Inc.</i> , 252 A.D.2d 294, 684 N.Y.S.2d 235 (1 <sup>st</sup> Dept. 1999)	35
Terra Homes v. Smallwood, 247 A.D.2d 394, 667 N.Y.S.2d 920 (2d Dept.), lv. denied, 92 N.Y.2d 809, 678 N.Y.S.2d 595, 700 N.E.2d 1231 (1998)	16
Wulfsohn v. Burden, 241 N.Y. 288, 302 N.E.2d 120 (1925)	25

## State Statutes Town Law § 267-a(5)(b) 2 3 Town Law § 267-b(1) Town Law § 276 17 Town Law § 277 16, 17, 19 5 Town Law § 282 Town of Milan Code 30 § 177-2 § 177-13(E) 17 § 177-21(B) 40 § 177-33 19 § 177-34 19 § 200-6.1(A) 30 § 200-39(A)(1) 29